AN BORD PLEANÁLA

LDG- 030562-20

ABP
11 SEP 2020

Fee: € Type:

Time: By: Post

Planning observation by: Address:

Paul Lynch Tuairín Leathard

Ballingeary
Macroom
Co Cork.

Date:

6th September 2020

Planning Reference No.:

PL04 .307939.

Applicant:

Cleanrath Wind Farm Ltd

Description:

The project which is the subject of the application for substitute consent comprises a 9 turbine wind farm and associated works including the grid connection used to export electricity to the national grid and access works

into the site to accommodate delivery of turbine components.

Location:

Townlands of Reananerree, Cloontycarthy, Cleanrath North, Derrineanig,

Cleanrath South, Milmorane, Coombilane, Rathgaskig, Augeris,

Gorteenakilla, Carrignadoura, Gurteenowen, Gurteenflugh, Lyrenageeha

and Lackabaun, Co. Cork

Date of Application:

12 August 2020

Submission Closing Date:

17 September 2020

Planning Authority:

The Secretary,

An Bord Pleanála.

64 Marlborough Street,

Dublin 1, D01 V902.

To whom it concerns

I wish to register the following observations on the planning application for the above proposed project.

Observations on the proposed project:

1. Energy use, security of supply and climate change
Wind power can cut into gas use in electricity generation, but as a third class power source
(variable and unpredictable) there are limits to how much can be absorbed by the grid. Earlier this
year a record was broken when wind power accounted for 60% electricity use overnight. Excess
wind-generated electricity that could not be put on the transmission system was exported to Great
Britain via interconnector links to Scotland and Wales.

http://www.eirgridgroup.com/newsroom/wind-record/

Planning observation by:

Tuairín Leathas,J

Vacroom

6th September 2020

21.04 307939

oplicant: Cleanrath Wind Farm Ltd

eseription: The project which is the subject of the application for substitute consent

connection used to export electricity to the national grid and access works

into the site to accommodate delivery of turbine components.

ation: Townlands of Reanancrree, Cloontycarthy, Cleanrath North, Derrineanie,

Cleanrain Youin, Milmolane, Coombilane, Rathgaskig, Augeris,

Gortecnakilla, Carrignadoura, Gurteenowen, Gurteenflugh, Lyrenagecha

and Lackabaun, Co. Conk

Date of Application: 12 August 2020

Submission Closing Bate: 17 September 2020

ine secretary,

An Bord Pleangla,

64 Marlborough Street.

Dublin 1,

To whom it concerns

wish to register the following observations on the planning application for the shove proposed assignt

Observations on the proposed project.

. Facety use, security of supply and characte change

Vind newer an out job gas use in electricity generation, but as a mind of as power source evariable, and agreed legisles here are limits to how insuch can be absorbed by the grid Eurher this year a record was broken when wand power account at a 60% electricity as a overnight. Excess which generated electricity that could not be put on the team mission system was expressed to the or store in the could not be put on the team mission system was expressed to the or store.

The state of the s

Making sacrifices for our own energy security is one thing but as the wind projects are almost entirely privately owned and as the limits of the Irish Grid is being reached to absorb wind power, it is more becoming increasingly a sacrifice only to enrich wealthy developers and their investors. Indeed because wind power and the burning of gas for electricity production go hand in hand, without radical change to the electricity-on-demand system we live in, domestic consumption of wind power will only meaningfully be able to increase if overall electricity use increases. This will of course also need an increase in a first class base load, ie fossil gas, and all of the human and environmental costs of the making and using of the gadgets and machines that use this power. In the context of anthropomorphic global warming, we should be slashing fossil greenhouse gas emissions from every sector of energy use. We primarily have fossil gas as our base load - and need the flexibility that only gas currently gives in quickly being able to ramp up and down power output to balance the variable wind contribution. This marriage of wind power usability to gas means that any reductions in gas use meaningful in the context of tackling climate change can only be achieved by decreasing overall electricity production and consumption. This scenario - a progressive reduction in overall energy consumption, would make the existing wind capacity more and more redundant in a domestic context when it is windy and further capacity planned even more so.

2. Although this application was originally rejected by Cork County Council, and subsequently by the Supreme Court, Cleanrath Wind Farm Ltd are still applying for substitute consent. 'By way of introduction, it is sufficient to state that, in May 2017, An Bord Pleanála granted permission (on appeal from a decision made by Cork County Council) for a wind energy development comprising 11 no. turbines and associated works (including substation and all grid connection works) at the site of the Cleanrath wind farm development (ABP Ref. PL04.246742) (hereafter referred to as the 2017 Permission). An Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and Appropriate Assessment (AA) was completed by the Board as part of its consideration of the appeal.' (EIAR non technical summary, ii)

Under what legal framework was An Bord Pleanála's appeal accepted? Surely this downplays the role of Cork County Council in the decision making process, thus indicating that the community's opinions are not being heard, through the only existing route they have, being the writing of observations (unless you can somehow afford to pay upwards of about €100,000 toward high/supreme court fees). Klaus Balz and Hannah Heubach subsequently won their court case in the supreme court, expending substantial personal and financial efforts just to fight for a fair outcome. https://www.irishexaminer.com/news/arid-30970057.html

Perhaps Cleanrath Windfarm Energy Ltd could have considered the 46 observations that were initially sent in to Cork County Council, instead of ignoring them. Perhaps they could have considered the adverse effects that they were forcing upon those who live closest to the windmills.

Are long scartices through own energy scene year needing but as the wind-projects are aimost countrely privately owns and as the limits of the bright is being reached to absorb wind power. It is more becoming increasingly a sacrificationly to entire wealthy developer and their investors, budged because wind power and the burning of gas for electricity production go hand in hand, without radical change to the electricity-on-demand system we live in, domestic consumption on wind power will only meaningfully be able to increase if overall electricity use increases. This will of course also need an increase for a first class base load, is fossil gas, and all of the human and environmental costs of the making and using of the gadgets and machines that use this power, and environmental costs of the making and using of the gadgets and machines that use this power, but the context of anthropomorphic global warming, we should be slashing fossil greenhouse gas emissions from every sector of energy use. We primarily have fossil gas as our base load - and energing the flexibility that only gas currently gives in quickly being able to ramp up and down now enterprit to balance the variable wind contribution. This macriage of wind power usability to gas only for activity to balance the variable wind contribution. This macriage of wind power usability to gas only for activities the context of raction and consumption. This sceneror and progressive reduction in overall energy consumption, would make the existing wind capacity progressive reduction in overall energy consumption, would make the existing wind capacity even more and more redundant in a domestic context when it is windy and further capacity planned.

Although this application was originally rejected by Cork County County, and subsequently by the Supreme Court. Cleanrath Wind Farm Ltd are still applying for substitute consent. By way of introduction, it is sufficient to state that, in May 2017, An Bord Pleadala granted permission (on appeal from a decision made by Cork County Council) for a wind energy development comprising 11 no, turbines and associated works (including substation and all grid connection works) at the site of the Catarrath wind, are development (ABP Ret. PL04,246742) (hereaffer referred to as the 2017 Permission). An Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and Appropriate Assessment (AA) was completed by the Board as pair of its consideration of the appeal. (EIA) non cehnical summary, ii)

Under what legal framework was An Bord Floandla's appeal accepted? Surely this downplays the role of Cork County Council in the decision making process, thus indicating that the community's opiations are not being heard, through the only existing court they have, being the writing of observations unitess you can somehow afford to pay apwards of about 100,000 toward high/supreme court fees). Klaus Bair and Hannah Herbach subsequently was their court of a infinite supreme court, expending substantial personal and financial efforts just to right for a fair outcome. It is a given man court court was a real or the court of the suprement of the suprementation of the suprementatio

Perhaps Cleanrath Windfarm Energy Lud could have considered the 45 onser, ations that were initially sent in the Cork County Council finaread or ignoring ment. Perhaps they could have considered the adverse effects that they were funcing upon those who live closest to the windoutse.

3. The legitimacy of the "exceptional circumstances" upon which the Board granted Cleanrath leave to apply for substitute consent are questionable. A recent supreme court judgement ruled that substitute consent applications are inconsistent with EU law and do not uphold the requirements of the EIA (Environmental Impact Assessment) directive. 'He found the substitute consent provisions do not sufficiently implement the EIA Directive in light of various decisions of the ECJ. The essential elements required for an application for leave for substitute consent, including the development at issue required an EIA, could not fairly be described as being exceptional and were rather "quite general and quite broad", he said.'

https://www.irishtimes.com/business/construction/supreme-court-rules-substitute-consent-inconsistent-with-eu-environmental-law-1 4293618

4. The White tailed sea eagle is rare due to about a hundred years of systematic persecution by human activities and was driven to an endangered or extinct status in many countries (It became extinct in Ireland in 1901). It has been reintroduced in Ireland in 2007. According to the supplied environmental impact assessment, there is no danger posed to the white tailed eagle due to a minimum of sightings in the surrounding area. 'White-tailed Eagle have been reintroduced to Ireland between 2007 and 2011 in Killarney Co. Kerry. There are an estimated 12 active territories of white-tailed eagle in the country, as well as several unpaired individuals. There was a single observation of this species between February 2015 and May 2020. The bird was recorded c. 7km from Cleanrath wind farm development. The development site was not found to be of significance to the species.' (Chapter 7, p. 56 EIAR) Birds are endangered to a higher degree than already known and proven, by wind turbines. https://www.smithsonianmag.com/smartnews/how-many-birds-do-wind-turbines-really-kill-180948154/

A white tailed sea eagle was killed by a wind turbine in Kilgarvan in 2011, due to the severing of a leg caused by the blades. This area had been designated as suitable for wind turbines. https://www.irishtimes.com/news/rare-sea-eagle-killed-by-wind-turbine-1.562592#:~:text=A%20WHITE%2DTAILED%20sea%20eagle,the%20Kerry%20county%20development%20plan.

Bogs or peatlands are known to be suitable foraging areas for white tailed eagles. 'Land areas also offer water bodies and bogs as potential foraging areas.' The issue is that the white tailed eagle does not appear to change its flight patterns in response to unprecedented objects such as wind turbines. 'However, the eagles still failed to show any sign of behavioural in-flight changes, making them more vulnerable to collision mortality.' (Habitat use of flying subadult White-tailed Eagles (Haliaeetus albicilla): implications for land use and wind power plant planning. Hannu Tikkanen*, Fabio Balotari-Chiebao, Toni Laaksonen, Veli-Matti Pakanen & Seppo Rytkönen Ornis Fennica 95: 137–150. 2018. P.146)

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/330185553 Habitat use of flying subadult White-tailed Eagles Haliaeetus albicilla implications for land use and wind power plant planning

L. The tegitionser of the "exceptional circumstants of apon which the Bond granted Cleanrath leave to apply for substitute constructed questionable. A recent applience count judgement trailed that substitute consent applications are inconsistent with left law and the not applied the requirements of fact LtA (Favironmental larguet Assessment) directive. The formathy and authorized assessment activities of a trailed sufficient and sufficiently traplementable of the laws of light at success data into the city of the described factorized as for a subscript consent, including the description of a successful and the consent and salter and pairs so at the consent at salter and as formation. Including the consent at salter and pairs so at the consent at salter and general, and the consent and as formation of the consent and a subscription of the consent and a salter and pairs so and the consent and a salter and pairs so and the consent and a salter and pairs so and the consent and the consent and a salter and a

enter gerunter large jar til skylter, storre til skylter enter entrækkent i kæreningstil akken til det skylte kinden i hanne entrækkent i hanne entrækkent i hanne entrækkent entrækkent entrækkent entrækkent och skylter

The Wince hilled sea eagle is the due to accord a numberly year of statement actorists and was driven a an endangered or events states in each a number (It became extine, in incland in 1901). It has been reintroduced in helpad of 2007. According to the supplied environment of impact assessment, there is non-ager posed to the a frie unled eagle due to a minimum of a sightings in the supposed prent Warter alloct of the area been reintroduced to inclared between 2007 and 2011 in Millarnet (In. Near Chord and each extinoduced to demicrosoft with a factor of the frequency of the frequency of the factor of the country of the factor of the first and May 2020. The hird was recorded a significance to the species here each fearuring 1015 and May 2020. The hird was recorded significance to the species (Chapter Chord and State of Condengered to a higher degree significance to the species.) (Chapter Chord and a condengered to a higher degree share all early long years by what maines age is said to a higher degree share and proven by what maines age is seen the condengered to a higher degree share and early long years by what maines age.

tries consed by the blades. This area had become signated as such is for a had rarbines.

1918 of the discharge course, we go see each thereby calculate a process of the process of the course of the

Bugs or pendands are known to be suitable reaging areas for white failed taples. If and areas also offer water bothes and begs as protectial foregong areas. If a issue is toat the white failed eagle does not appear to change its in the participant in appear to objects such as wind turbines. However, the engles will failed to show any ago at centariously of high changes a plaint mean viting about to confision a show any ago at centariously of high changes in aking them many timetable to confision a such and associated and appeared to the change of a subadult white-tailed in a subadult implies gone to land associated as a disposit plant plant of high and it should be subadult to high a subadult white tailed a subadult in the subadult is a social with the change of the subadult of the subad

and the state of t

It is clear on the Biodiversity Ireland website that there have been a large cluster of sightings in close proximity to the Cleanrath area. This indicates the possibility of the sea eagles choosing to fly further inland in order to forage from the boggy areas such as that which is directly next to the wind turbines. These risks have not been duly considered in the application.

In view of the observations above I request that An Bord Pleanála refuse permission for this application for substitute consent.

Is mise le meas, Paul Lynch

AN BORD PLEANÁLA

1 1 SEP 2020

LTR DATED FROM
LDGABP-

In that on the Blad's easily before well we that there is a reconstance of rightings in a close proximity to the Cleanach and This indicates the possibility of the sea cagles choosing to the first second in transfer to longe from the bogs; areas such as many shids in directly next to the cited anches. Those risks have not been duly constituted in the application.

In view of the observations above I request that An Bord Pleanata refuse permission for this application for substitute consent.

ls mise le meas. Paul Lynch

AM BORD PLEANALA

SET 2020

FINDATEL

HOM

ABP.